

Industrialization of Manchester DBQ

Sample Responses – AP European History



SAMPLE RESPONSE A (7/7)

NEGATIVE (Working Conditions)	POSITIVE (Economic Growth)	IMPROVEMENT (CCoT)
Doc 1 – Romantic Doc 4 – Socialist Doc 3 – Downside	Doc 2 – Liberal Doc 3 – Upside	Doc 5 – Everything Looks Great Doc 6 – Improvement Doc 7 – Improvement Incomplete
Contextualization: Industrial Revolution		Outside Evidence: Repeal of Corn Laws / Public Health

<p>The Industrial Revolution began in Britain in the middle of the eighteenth century. Things progressed slowly, at first, with rural families operating spinning jennies in a home setting known as “cottage industry.” When James Watt perfected the steam engine in the 1760s, factory cities became possible. Manchester was one of the largest cities created by the Industrial Revolution. Although the living and working conditions in Manchester were atrocious, the industrialization of Manchester was an overall positive development for Britain because of the MASSIVE economic growth it created. Furthermore, evidence indicates that conditions improved substantially later in the nineteenth century (today, Manchester is best known for its “football” team).</p>	<p>CONTEXTUALIZATION presents a big picture with details, including the spinning jenny, cottage industry, and James Watt’s work on the steam engine.</p> <p>A THESIS is present that makes multiple historically defensible claims that are supported by a line of reasoning. This thesis presents a complex and nuanced argument by noting the presence of disadvantages and by accounting for change over time.</p>
<p>There is no denying it: the industrialization of Manchester was downright ugly. Robert Southey, a Romantic poet, wrote of how the city was like a convent but without any beauty or holiness and where people worked rather than prayed (Doc 1). Southey’s assessment is exactly what would be expected of a Romantic, as Romantics tend to judge things in relation to natural beauty with no concern for the bottom line. French observers were also disgusted – note that France had yet to experience the Industrial Revolution (which is why they lost the Franco-Prussian War to a more industrialized opponent). Flora Tristan, a French socialist, complained that the workers didn’t even have potatoes to eat, worked twelve hour days, and breathed foul air (Doc 4). Being a socialist, Tristan thought only about how industrialization was affecting the working class and not about overall growth – she even challenges the liberal value of progress at all costs when she asked whether progress could only be bought at the</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will address the downsides of industrialization.</p> <p>DOC 1 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p> <p>A small amount of OUTSIDE EVIDENCE is presented – not necessarily enough to earn the point on its own merit.</p> <p>DOC 4 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p>

<p>cost of men’s lives. Alexis de Tocqueville, a French tourist, noted that no one seemed happy in this “filthy sewer,” as he called it (Doc 3).</p>	<p>DOC 3 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p>
<p>Although the Industrial Revolution was very ugly when it was up close and personal, the big picture – the creation of unprecedented economic growth – cannot be ignored. Tocqueville, who was so disgusted by what he saw in Manchester, noted that “pure gold flows” from the filthy sewer that “flows out to fertilize the whole world” (Doc 3). In economics, there are always costs and benefits – nothing is without a price. And maybe things weren’t so great in the first place. Thomas Macaulay, a liberal member of Parliament, challenged Southey and the Romantics and their idea that pre-industrial Britain had been all “flower gardens, beehives, and orchards.” Macaulay argued that the people of Manchester were actually better fed and clothed than they had been before the Industrial Revolution (Doc 2). As a liberal and a member of Parliament, Macaulay was prone to defend the system that was certainly benefitting his class of people. Classical liberals in the nineteenth century were unambivalent in their approach to technological progress – which explains why Macaulay and Southey disagreed so strongly regarding industrialization.</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will focus on the advantages of industrialization.</p> <p>DOC 3 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence. <i>Doc 3 should not be counted twice on the rubric but the second use strengthens the argument.</i></p> <p>DOC 2 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence <i>and is put into conversation with another document. Generally, quotes should be avoided but they’re okay if used sparingly and only to quote a phrase – never an entire sentence.</i></p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p> <p><i>Note the Point of View has been used every time so far for POV+ analysis. That is okay.</i></p> <p>A conversation between conflicting pieces of evidence noting the contradiction between the two helps to earn the COMPLEX UNDERSTANDING point.</p>
<p>If things had not improved, it might be difficult to decide whether industrialization was good for Britain or not, but things improved a great deal thanks to technology and the responsiveness of Parliament. William Abram, a journalist and historian, noted that conditions had improved because of the passage of the Ten Hour Act and other laws aimed at reforming the factory system to make things cleaner and reduce working hours (Doc 6). As a journalist, Abram would probably get more readers if he criticized conditions and wrote about how bad things were, so what he says is reliable because it wouldn’t gain him as many readers. The preface to a business directory called Manchester “remarkable and attractive” although this can be dismissed as pro-industry propaganda from the business leaders (Doc 5). Although things were not perfect, Parliament repealed the Corn Laws in the 1840s, which brought down the price of food. In addition, public health reforms and the efforts of Edward Chadwick made the city cleaner with better drinking water. Although there were improvements, an engraving in <u>The Graphic</u> magazine shows a “filthy sewer” like Tocqueville had described decades earlier and a cathedral in the background is barely visible because of all the smoke – showing that maybe</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will focus on improvement of conditions.</p> <p>DOC 6 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW and/or AUDIENCE (POV+)</p> <p>DOC 5 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p> <p>OUTSIDE EVIDENCE supports the argument that conditions improved. Note the MINOR ERROR with Edwin Chadwick’s first name, which DOES NOT disqualify the evidence presented.</p> <p>DOC 7 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence. <i>It is also put in conversation with other documents.</i></p>

<p>people were still doing more working than praying (Doc 7). The picture's ugliness could be explained by the content of <u>The Graphic</u>, which focused on social issues. A social issues magazine needs social problems in order to gain readers.</p>	<p>POINT OF VIEW and/or AUDIENCE (POV+) This paragraph's emphasis on Continuity and Change Over time helps to earn the COMPLEX UNDERSTANDING point.</p>
<p>Although the Industrial Revolution was ugly and horrible for workers for a long time, it was an overall positive development for Britain because of the unprecedented economic growth and the improvement of conditions after 1850.</p>	<p>THESIS RESTATED without looking back at the original thesis. If it didn't get credit the first time, maybe the second attempt will get credit.</p>

SCORING SUMMARY

Contextualization	1	A relevant big picture with multiple details is presented at the beginning of the essay.
Thesis	1	The thesis includes a valid and defensible line of reasoning, takes a clear position, and reflects complexity with the CCoT angle
Accurately Described (3+)	1	All documents are accurately described.
Supporting Evidence (6+)	1	All documents are used as evidence to support an argument in the topic sentence of the paragraph.
POV+ (3+)	1	Several valid attempts at POV+ in this essay beyond what is necessary for credit
Outside Evidence	1	Corn Laws and Public Health in final body paragraph
Complex Understanding	1	This essay exceeds expectations on all fronts with a complex thesis, skilled use of evidence, POV+ analysis beyond the requirements, and the emphasis on CCoT in the final body paragraph.
TOTAL	7	

This sample essay was written in order to provide greater clarity for teachers and students regarding the expectations of the AP European History DBQ.

If you have scored DBQs professionally as an AP Reader and would like to offer criticism or feedback, please [contact me](#) through my website with any suggestions or to discuss this further. I welcome any opportunity I can to improve these sample essays so that teachers can benefit from them. Feel free to submit feedback anonymously if you would prefer.

Industrialization of Manchester DBQ

Sample Responses – AP European History



SAMPLE RESPONSE B (4/7)

POSITIVE VIEWPOINTS	NEGATIVE VIEWPOINTS
<p>Doc 2 Doc 3 Doc 5 Doc 6</p>	<p>Doc 1 Doc 7 Doc 4</p>
Contextualization: Industrial Revolution	Outside Evidence

<p>The Industrial Revolution started in Britain with the invention of the spinning jenny. Pretty soon, it grew even more because of James Watt's steam engine and industrial cities like Manchester sprang up. The industrialization of Manchester was a good thing for Britain because of economic growth, but a lot of people suffered from the horrible working conditions.</p>	<p>We could debate whether this would earn the CONTEXTUALIZATION or OUTSIDE EVIDENCE point, but since this is the only outside evidence presented in the essay, the distinction doesn't particularly matter here.</p> <p>A THESIS is present that makes a historically defensible claim supported by a line of reasoning.</p>
<p>The Industrial Revolution grew Britain's economy. Thomas Macaulay said that people had more to eat, more clothes, and better health because of industrialization (Doc 2). Even though the city was really dirty, Alexis de Tocqueville wrote, "From this filthy sewer, pure gold flows," so he realized that it was good for the economy (Doc 3). Things seemed to get better after Tocqueville saw Manchester, because a business directory called Manchester "remarkable and attractive" so the city must not have been that ugly anymore (Doc 5). William Abram, a journalist, said that the improvements were because Parliament had passed legislation to help people and reduce their work hours (Doc 6). So overall, the Industrial Revolution was a good thing.</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will address economic growth.</p> <p>DOC 2 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>DOC 3 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>NOTE that all quotes are limited to short phrases. Quotes should be avoided whenever possible and should be accompanied by further explanation when used.</p> <p>DOC 5 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>DOC 6 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>NOTE that there is no attempt at POV+ in this paragraph, but all evidence supports the argument.</p>
<p>Not everyone was a fan of the Industrial revolution. Some people complained about how ugly</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will focus on opposition to industrialization.</p>

<p>and dirty the city was. Robert Southey, a Romantic poet, called the city “destitute” and said that all the buildings were black with smoke (Doc 1). The ugliness can be seen in a picture from <u>The Graphic</u> magazine, where there are a bunch of smokestacks and you can barely see the sky through the smoke (Doc 7). Flora Tristan, a socialist, complained about how the workers had nothing to eat and had to breathe bad air (Doc 4). Since Tristan was a socialist, she cared more about how the workers were doing than about the economy.</p>	<p>DOC 1 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>DOC 7 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>DOC 4 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p>
<p>So even though the industrialization of Manchester could be ugly and dirty, it was a good thing overall because of economic growth.</p>	<p>THESIS RESTATED without looking back at the original thesis. If it didn't get credit the first time, maybe the second attempt will get credit.</p>

SCORING SUMMARY

Contextualization	1	Some readers might choose to count this as Outside Evidence instead of contextualization, but the score remains the same either way.
Thesis	1	The thesis includes a valid and defensible line of reasoning.
Accurately Described (3+)	1	All documents were accurately described.
Supporting Evidence (6+)	1	All documents were used as evidence to support an argument in the topic sentence of the paragraph.
POV+ (3+)	0	Only one attempt at POV+ in this essay
Outside Evidence	0	Not attempted (outside of Contextualization)
Complex Understanding	0	There was a brief nod to CCoT in the first body paragraph, but not enough to warrant awarding this point.
TOTAL	4	

This sample essay was written in order to provide greater clarity for teachers and students regarding the expectations of the AP European History DBQ.

If you have scored DBQs professionally as an AP Reader and would like to offer criticism or feedback, please [contact me](#) through my website with any suggestions or to discuss this further. I welcome any opportunity I can to improve these sample essays so that teachers can benefit from them. Feel free to submit feedback anonymously if you would prefer.

Industrialization of Manchester DBQ

Sample Responses – AP European History



SAMPLE RESPONSE C (4/7)

NEGATIVE VIEWPOINTS (Used to Support Argument)	POSITIVE VIEWPOINTS (Challenged to Support Argument)
<p>Doc 1 - romantic Doc 4 - socialist Doc 3 - Not socialist</p>	<p>Doc 5 Doc 2</p>
<p>Contextualization</p>	<p>Outside Evidence: Communist Manifesto</p>

<p>The industrialization of Manchester was a bad thing for Britain because it was bad for the environment and made workers live miserable lives.</p>	<p>A THESIS is present that makes a historically defensible claim supported by a line of reasoning.</p>
<p>Several sources agree that Manchester was an ugly city with filthy air. Robert Southey, a Romantic poet, said that Manchester was the ugliest place he had ever seen full of buildings that were covered with black smoke (Doc 1). Even though Southey should be taken with a grain of salt since Romantics were opposed to the Industrial Revolution, other people agreed with him. Flora Tristan, a French socialist, wrote about how the workers were poorly fed and had to breathe bad air (Doc 4). Since Flora Tristan was a socialist, it is understandable that she would focus on the workers because socialists believed that workers were being exploited by capitalists. Karl Marx, another socialist, wrote the <u>Communist Manifesto</u>, where he predicted that the workers would one day overthrow the bourgeoisie in a violent uprising.</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will address economic growth.</p> <p>DOC 1 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p> <p>DOC 4 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p> <p>OUTSIDE EVIDENCE is presented to support the argument. This is what I call the "Document 8" approach to outside evidence: referring to a relevant historical document that is not included in the DBQ.</p>
<p>People who weren't socialists also found Manchester disgusting. Alexis de Tocqueville, who was probably an aristocrat because of his fancy name, said that no one in Manchester was happy and that the city was a "filthy sewer" (Doc 3). De Tocqueville wasn't trying to start a revolution – he just wanted to tell people back home about what he saw – so this point of view is even more reliable than Tristan's.</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will focus on opposition to industrialization.</p> <p>DOC 3 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>PURPOSE (POV+)</p>

<p>Everyone who said that things were good in Manchester had a selfish reason for saying so. A business directory called Manchester the “workshop of the world” and said it was an attractive place - even though no one else seems to think so (Doc 5). The business leaders were using this directory to promote the city and make it sound as good as possible - not to give an accurate account of what it looked like. Thomas Macaulay, a liberal member of Parliament, said that workers in Manchester were better fed and clothed than they had been before industrialization (Doc 2), but then, Macaulay was a liberal and classical liberals were big supporters of industrialization. As a member of Parliament, Macaulay was also privileged and obviously not a factory worker who had to breathe bad air all the time.</p>	<p>A TOPIC SENTENCE makes it clear that this paragraph will focus on opposition to industrialization.</p> <p>DOC 5 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>PURPOSE (POV+)</p> <p>DOC 2 is accurately described and used as evidence to support the topic sentence.</p> <p>POINT OF VIEW (POV+)</p>
<p>So basically, everyone who defended the Industrial Revolution had selfish reasons for doing so. The Industrialization of Manchester was bad for Britain because it was terrible for the environments and ruined the lives of workers.</p>	<p>THESIS RESTATED without looking back at the original thesis. If it didn't get credit the first time, maybe the second attempt will get credit.</p>

SCORING SUMMARY

Contextualization	0	Not Attempted
Thesis	1	The thesis included a valid and defensible line of reasoning.
Accurately Described (3+)	1	Five documents are accurately described.
Supporting Evidence (6+)	0	Only five documents were used in this essay.
POV+ (3+)	1	Every document used was analyzed with POV+
Outside Evidence	1	The Communist Manifesto is accurately described and its author properly attributed in the context of socialist opposition to the factory system.
Complex Understanding	0	This essay is not especially brilliant or sophisticated.
TOTAL	4	

This sample essay was written in order to provide greater clarity for teachers and students regarding the expectations of the AP European History DBQ.

If you have scored DBQs professionally as an AP Reader and would like to offer criticism or feedback, please [contact me](#) through my website with any suggestions or to discuss this further. I welcome any opportunity I can to improve these sample essays so that teachers can benefit from them. Feel free to submit feedback anonymously if you would prefer.

Industrialization of Manchester DBQ

Sample Responses – AP European History



SAMPLE RESPONSE D (2/7)

<p>The Industrial Revolution had many advantages and disadvantages for Manchester in the nineteenth century.</p>	<p>The attempt at a thesis is INSUFFICIENT to earn a point – lacks a claim and line of reasoning. Too vague!</p>
<p>Robert Southey, a Romantic poet, called Manchester a destitute city filled with black smoke and the noise of machines (Doc 1). Robert Southey was a Romantic and Romantics did not like the Industrial Revolution. There was a Romantic poet who called factories “dark Satanic mills.” Romantics liked nature and thought that industrial cities were bad for people. Thomas Macaulay, a member of Parliament, disagreed with Southey and said that people in Manchester were well fed and Britain was wealthier because of manufacturing (Doc 2). Alexis de Tocqueville seemed kind of grossed out when he called Manchester a “filthy sewer” but then he also said that pure gold flows out of it so he seems kind of conflicted (Doc 3).</p>	<p>No topic sentence or overall argument present, but the writer ACCURATELY DESCRIBES three documents.</p> <p>DOC 1 is accurately described.</p> <p>The lone attempt at POV+ can contribute to the OUTSIDE EVIDENCE presented here about Romanticism. Omitting William Blake’s name is not a problem since the poem is quoted correctly and the writer connects Romanticism to the topic of the prompt.</p> <p>DOC 2 is accurately described.</p> <p>DOC 3 is accurately described.</p>

SCORING SUMMARY

Contextualization	0	Not Attempted
Thesis	0	Insufficient
Accurately Described (3+)	1	Three documents are accurately described.
Supporting Evidence (6+)	0	Documents are not used to support an argument.
POV+ (3+)	0	Only One Attempt – connected with Outside Evidence
Outside Evidence	1	Romanticism is connected to the topic of the prompt.
Complex Understanding	0	Definitely nothing complex about this essay!
TOTAL	2	

This sample essay was written in order to provide greater clarity for teachers and students regarding the expectations of the AP European History DBQ.

If you have scored DBQs professionally as an AP Reader and would like to offer criticism or feedback, please [contact me](#) through my website with any suggestions or to discuss this further. I welcome any opportunity I can to improve these sample essays so that teachers can benefit from them. Feel free to submit feedback anonymously if you would prefer.